Dr. Gary Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31, Response to Spiritual Gifts Questions, 1 Cor. 13-14, Excursus on Gifts Resources from NotebookLM

- 1) Abstract, 2) Audio podcast, 3) Briefing Document, 4) Study Guide, and 5) FAQs
- 1. Abstract of Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31, Response to Spiritual Gifts Questions, 1 Cor. 13-14, Excursus on Gifts, Biblicalelearning.org

Dr. Gary Meadors' Lecture 31 on 1 Corinthians chapters 12-14 addresses the topic of spiritual gifts by providing a historical overview of the Charismatic and Renewal Movements in 20th-century America. He outlines the three waves of this movement: Pentecostalism, the Charismatic Renewal, and the Third Wave (Wimber Movement), noting their key characteristics and the ongoing debates surrounding supernatural gifts. The lecture further examines the theological positions of cessationism and noncessationism, highlighting key figures and arguments from both sides, emphasizing the importance of epistemology and thorough research in understanding these perspectives.

2. 14 - minute Audio Podcast Created on the basis of Dr. Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31 − Double click icon to play in Windows media player or go to the Biblicalelearning.org [BeL] Site and click the audio podcast link there (New Testament → Pauline Epistles → 1 Corinthians).



3. Briefing Document: Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31, Response to Spiritual Gifts Questions, 1 Cor. 13-14, Excursus on Gifts

Briefing Document: Dr. Gary Meadors on the Charismatic and Renewal Movement

Overview: This lecture by Dr. Gary Meadors provides a historical overview of the Charismatic and Renewal Movement as it relates to the discussion of spiritual gifts, particularly miraculous ones, in 1 Corinthians 12-14. Meadors outlines the "three waves" of this movement: Pentecostalism, the Charismatic Renewal, and the Third Wave (Wimber Movement). He also delves into the theological debate between cessationism (the belief that miraculous gifts ceased after the apostolic age) and non-cessationism (the belief that these gifts continue today), offering insights into the key arguments and proponents of each view. Meadors emphasizes the importance of thorough research and understanding the theological constructs underlying these different perspectives.

Main Themes and Important Ideas/Facts:

1. Introduction and Context:

- The lecture focuses on a historical overview of the Charismatic and Renewal Movement in relation to spiritual gifts discussed in 1 Corinthians 12-14.
- Meadors notes that his lecture's historical information is somewhat dated (late 1980s/early 1990s) but the essential information remains relevant.
- He stresses the importance of being a student and researcher of 1 Corinthians, reading quality literature, and understanding the historical context of these discussions.

2. The Three Waves of the Renewal Movement:

- Meadors introduces the "three waves" framework for understanding the movement, based on the work titled "Three Waves" which likely refers to C. Peter Wagner's classification.
- **First Wave: Pentecostalism:**Began in earnest in the early 1900s, building on earlier American Revivalism and originating in black and non-white communities in the mid-1700s.
- Characterized by an interracial aspect.

- The Azusa Street Revival (1906-1913) led by William Seymour is a landmark event.
- Emotionalism was a significant component, seen as providing "empirical evidence" of touching the divine.
- Pentecostals who experienced these spiritual manifestations were often rejected by mainline denominations and formed their own (e.g., Church of God, Assemblies of God).
- A distinctive teaching was the necessity of a post-conversion religious experience called "baptism in the Holy Spirit."
- Speaking in tongues was often seen as a "litmus test" for this baptism.
- Pentecostalism developed its own denominational structures and has experienced significant growth, particularly in South and Central America.
- **Second Wave: Charismatic Renewal:**Individuals within mainline denominations adopted Pentecostal doctrines and the idea of the baptism of the Holy Spirit and the exercise of supernatural gifts.
- Unlike Pentecostals, they generally stayed within their existing denominations, forming subgroups.
- They also spawned new works like businessmen's associations (e.g., Christian Businessmen's Organization).
- Statistics from 1988 indicated a significant number of Protestants and Roman Catholics involved in this movement.
- Their focus was also heavily on the "baptism of the Spirit" and the "Second Work of Grace."
- Third Wave: Wimber Movement: Views itself as distinct from the first two waves and prefers not to be labeled Pentecostal or Charismatic.
- Still holds the supernatural gifts of the Spirit as normative.
- Associated with John Wimber and the Vineyard Church.
- Peter Wagner's book, "The Third Wave of the Holy Spirit," popularized this movement.

- An experimental class at Fuller Seminary with John Wimber brought it into public view.
- Wimber emphasized the availability of supernatural gifts but didn't necessarily focus on proving miracles, instead focusing on the perceived benefit and spiritual experience of individuals (e.g., the "Toronto Blessing").
- The movement has faced internal issues, particularly regarding the role of apostles and prophets today.
- It has influenced many levels of evangelical Christianity.
- Fuller Seminary, with Peter Wagner's course "Signs, Wonders, and Church Growth," was a key center.
- Even Dallas Theological Seminary experienced internal conflict related to the Third Wave, leading to the dismissal of professors who adhered to its ideas.

3. The Cessationism vs. Non-Cessationism Debate:

- Meadors highlights the central debate surrounding the continuation of miraculous gifts.
- **Cessationism:**Argues that miraculous gifts on demand did not continue beyond the apostolic age (first century).
- Generally associated with a Calvinistic view of history and theology, emphasizing no ongoing revelatory activity beyond Scripture.
- Sees Scripture as complete and sufficient.
- Views the Holy Spirit as attendant to the Word, not above or beyond it.
- Considers the apostles as unique and foundational for the church (Ephesians 2:20), with specially given gifts for authentication.
- Relies on theological arguments rather than experiential claims.
- Representative Cessationists: B.B. Warfield (though Meadors considers him less relevant to the modern debate), Richard Gaffin ("Perspectives on Pentecost" is a major work), John Murray (collected writings), Robert Soce (open but cautious).
- **Key Argument:** The foundational character of the apostles and prophets in establishing the church and authenticating God's Word. The temporary nature of the apostolate.

- Meadors explicitly states that 1 Corinthians 13:10 should NOT be used as a proof text for cessationism, as it refers to the eschaton (the time when that which is perfect has come).
- **Non-Cessationism:**Believes that all miraculous gifts of the first century continue throughout church history.
- Often associated with a non-Calvinistic view of history and theology.
- Views miracle charismata as conveying revelation and for edification, rather than primarily for validation.
- Tends to see the signs of the apostles as normative for all Christians.
- Many redefine the apostolate, seeing it as a continuing gift or office.
- Some hold a view of scripture and revelation as ongoing rather than completely sufficient.
- Employs a "hermeneutic of continuity," claiming total continuity between the Bible and the present-day church regarding spiritual gifts.
- Representative Non-Cessationists: John Ruthven ("The Cessation of the Charismata" is a key work), Jack Deere.
- **Key Argument:** Taking the New Testament at "face value," seeing the first-century practices regarding gifts as normative for the entire church age. Miraculous gifts equip the church for ministry until the end of the age.
- **Challenges and Observations:**The definition of the miraculous has broadened, sometimes equating emotional victories with miracle power.
- Epistemology is the bottom-line issue in this debate.
- Even John Wimber acknowledged that some activity in his services was "self-induced" but considered it beneficial.
- The absence of consistent emphasis on miraculous gifts as a necessary part of ongoing ministry in the Pastoral Epistles raises questions for non-cessationists.
- There are discontinuities observed between the nature of first-century gifts (e.g., xenolalia in tongues) and those often exercised today.

• The continuing apostolate, a logical conclusion of some non-cessationist views (as argued by Ruthven), is seen as epistemologically problematic by cessationists in relation to Scripture.

4. Importance of Research and Critical Thinking:

- Meadors repeatedly emphasizes the need for individuals to conduct their own thorough research on both sides of the cessationism/non-cessationism debate.
- He encourages reading widely, engaging with primary sources, and understanding the theological presuppositions of different authors.
- He stresses that personal opinions are insufficient without proper homework and research.
- He provides a bibliography of key authors and works to begin this research (Gaffin, Grudem, Redmond, Ruthven, Turner, Fowler-White).

Quotes:

- "Research is just reading. Reading the best material you can get your hands on.
 Journal articles the better commentaries. You read for information. You don't just plow through words."
- "The three waves are Pentecostalism, Charismatic, and Third Wave, which is the Wimber Movement. The three waves created 38 categories for classification, but the continuity key is the renewal in the Holy Spirit as one single cohesive movement..."
- "Pentecostalism was strongly based on a post-conversion baptism of the Holy Spirit experience."
- "Individuals within the mainline denominations adopted the Pentecostal doctrine, along with the alleged baptism of the Holy Spirit and the exercise of supernatural gifts. These individuals formed subgroups within their denominations. They didn't leave, and they stayed in."
- "The Third Wave views itself as significantly different than the First and Second Wave, and indeed, it is. While still holding the supernatural gifts of the Spirit as normative for the Church today, they have adopted neither the label Pentecostal nor the label Charismatic."
- Regarding Wimber's response to laughing exercises: "He said, I don't know, and I
 don't really care, but I know that person. He's a lawyer. He lives a stress-filled life.

And if God can help him to reduce his stress and to find relaxation in the spirit, that's just fine."

- "Claims are not authority. Theology is authority..."
- Regarding the dismissal of professors at Dallas Seminary: "...over the question of adherence to the seminary's non-charismatic doctrinal stance and practice."
- Regarding non-cessationists: "The non-cessationists seem to have a biblical argument since they merely claim total continuity between the Bible and firstcentury church with church today."
- "The cessationists...must rest their case on theological arguments and suspend answering the numerous experiential arguments."
- Even Wimber admitted on Peter Jennings special that much of the activity in his service was self-induced. But it provides healing for the participant and is, therefore, okay."
- "God can do anything he pleases. God can perform a miracle anytime he pleases.
 The debate between cessation and non-cessation is more of a debate about whether this individual is gifted to do that on demand."
- "The classic cessationist argument that miraculous sign gifts ceased with the end of the apostolic age I have outlined for you here..."
- Regarding the temporary nature of the apostolate: "...Ruthven was consistent
 calling for apostles today, which has to be part of the non-cessationist view, and
 to me that's very troubling epistemologically. I have problems with that in relation
 to Scripture."
- Paul stating the requirement for an apostle: "This aspect requires that one be an eyewitness of the resurrected Christ."
- "First of all, 1 Corinthians 13.10 should never, never, never, never, never be used as a proof text for cessationism. That was very popular in the 70s and the 80s. Forget it. That's not good exegesis. 1 Corinthians 13.10 is about the eschaton."
- Regarding non-cessationists' hermeneutic: "Totally flat. Total continuity. No
 hermeneutical issues involved with is it prescriptive or descriptive or any of that.
 Well, that's easy to do. And it makes them seem biblical. But I think that is a
 little bit dangerous."

- Packer's observation: "...either to reject the experiences as delusive and possibly demonic in origin, after all or to re-theologize them in a way which shows that the truth which they actually evidence and confirm is something different from what the charismatics themselves suppose. This is the choice that we now face."
- "The bottom-line issue to me is epistemology."
- "Your opinion isn't worth squat if you haven't done your homework, read, read, read, research, research, research if you want to be a valid and helpful ministry leader."

Conclusion:

Dr. Meadors provides a valuable overview of the historical development of the Charismatic and Renewal Movement and the ongoing theological debate surrounding spiritual gifts. He emphasizes the complexity of the issue and the need for rigorous research and critical engagement with various perspectives. By outlining the key characteristics of Pentecostalism, the Charismatic Renewal, and the Third Wave, and by presenting the core arguments of cessationism and non-cessationism with representative figures and literature, Meadors equips his audience to delve deeper into this significant area of Christian theology and practice. His strong encouragement for personal study and his cautions against simplistic interpretations underscore the importance of intellectual honesty and a commitment to understanding the foundational theological constructs at play.

4. Study Guide: Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31, Response to Spiritual Gifts Questions, 1 Cor. 13-14, Excursus on Gifts

Understanding Spiritual Gifts: A Study Guide

Quiz:

- 1. According to Meadors, what is the primary activity involved in research? Why is it important to read the "best material"?
- 2. Briefly describe the "three waves" of the Renewal Movement mentioned by Meadors, including their key characteristics and labels.
- 3. What was the significance of the "baptism in the Holy Spirit" in the Pentecostal movement, and what was often considered the initial evidence of this experience?
- 4. How did the Charismatic Renewal differ from Pentecostalism in its approach to mainline denominations? What was a common focus of the Charismatic movement?
- 5. What distinguishes the "Third Wave" movement from the first two waves, and which church is mentioned as a key representative of this movement?
- 6. Explain the incident at Dallas Theological Seminary involving the dismissal of three professors. What was the central issue leading to their departure?
- 7. What is the "hermeneutic of continuity" as it relates to the discussion of spiritual gifts? According to Meadors, what is a potential danger of this approach?
- 8. Define cessationism and non-cessationism in the context of spiritual gifts. Which theological tradition is often associated with cessationism?
- 9. According to Meadors, what is the major foundational argument used by cessationists regarding the nature of apostles and prophets?
- 10. Why does Meadors state that 1 Corinthians 13:10 should not be used as a primary proof text for cessationism? What does he believe is the correct context of this passage?

Answer Key:

1. Research is primarily reading the best material available, such as journal articles and better commentaries. Reading high-quality sources is crucial to gain accurate

- information and a deeper understanding of the subject matter, moving beyond superficial engagement with the text.
- 2. The first wave, Pentecostalism, began in the early 1900s with an emphasis on a post-conversion baptism of the Holy Spirit and supernatural gifts, often marked by speaking in tongues. The second wave, the Charismatic Renewal, saw individuals within mainline denominations adopting Pentecostal doctrines and practices while remaining within their existing churches. The third wave, associated with the Wimber Movement, accepted supernatural gifts as normative but rejected the labels Pentecostal and Charismatic, focusing on "power evangelism" and "power healing."
- 3. In Pentecostalism, the baptism in the Holy Spirit was considered a necessary post-conversion religious experience for believers. Speaking in tongues was often viewed as the initial and primary "litmus test" or empirical evidence that a believer had received this baptism.
- 4. Unlike Pentecostals who formed new denominations, the Charismatic Renewal involved individuals adopting Pentecostal beliefs and practices within their existing mainline denominations, forming subgroups rather than leaving. A common focus of the Charismatic movement was spreading the word of this "second work of grace" and the experience of the baptism of the Holy Spirit.
- 5. The Third Wave differs from the first two by deliberately avoiding the labels Pentecostal and Charismatic while still affirming the normative nature of supernatural spiritual gifts for the church today. The Vineyard Church is mentioned as one of the main representative churches of the founding of this Third Wave.
- 6. Dallas Theological Seminary dismissed three professors (Walter Bodine, Jack Deere, and Donald Sanoukian) because they confessed adherence to the ideas of the Third Wave, which were considered charismatic and conflicted with the seminary's non-charismatic doctrinal stance and practice. Their dismissal in the middle of the academic year highlighted the seriousness of this divergence in theological views.
- 7. The "hermeneutic of continuity" is the approach of claiming a total and direct continuity between the biblical accounts of spiritual gifts in the first-century church and the way they are understood and practiced in the church today.

 Meadors suggests this can be dangerous because it may overlook contextual

- restrictions, prescriptive versus descriptive elements in scripture, and the need for careful hermeneutical questions.
- 8. Cessationism is the view that miraculous spiritual gifts, such as healing and prophecy on demand, ceased after the apostolic age, typically understood as the end of the first century. Non-cessationism is the belief that these miraculous gifts continue to be available and operative in the church today. Cessationism is generally, though not exclusively, associated with the Calvinistic theological tradition.
- 9. The major foundational argument of cessationists centers on the unique and foundational role of the apostles and prophets in the early church, particularly in authenticating and establishing the written Word of God (Ephesians 2:20). They view the apostolic age as distinct, with specific gifts given to these individuals for these foundational purposes, which are not meant to continue in the same way.
- 10. Meadors argues that 1 Corinthians 13:10, which speaks of "when that which is perfect has come," refers to the eschaton, the final state of things, rather than the completion of the Bible or the cessation of spiritual gifts. He believes using this verse as a proof text for cessationism is poor exegesis because the immediate context of 1 Corinthians 13 discusses partial and complete knowledge and prophecy in relation to the future perfect state.

Essay Format Questions:

- 1. Discuss the historical development of the Renewal Movement, outlining the key characteristics and theological distinctives of Pentecostalism, the Charismatic Renewal, and the Third Wave. Analyze the reasons for their emergence and their impact on contemporary Christianity.
- Compare and contrast the cessationist and non-cessationist perspectives on spiritual gifts, as presented by Meadors. Identify the key theological and epistemological differences between these viewpoints, and discuss the scriptural and historical arguments each employs.
- 3. Evaluate the significance of the apostolic office and the role of prophets in the debate between cessationism and non-cessationism. How do different understandings of these roles influence the conclusions drawn about the continuation of miraculous gifts?

- 4. Analyze the epistemological challenges inherent in evaluating claims of miraculous spiritual gifts in the present day. Discuss the tension between experiential claims and theological frameworks, and consider the criteria by which such claims might be assessed.
- 5. Explore the hermeneutical considerations crucial for interpreting biblical passages related to spiritual gifts. Discuss the importance of context, genre, and the distinction between descriptive and prescriptive texts in forming informed theological conclusions about the continuation of these gifts.

Glossary of Key Terms:

- Charismatic Renewal: A movement within mainline Protestant and Catholic denominations where individuals adopted Pentecostal doctrines and the practice of spiritual gifts, but generally remained within their existing church structures.
- **Cessationism:** The theological belief that certain miraculous spiritual gifts (e.g., prophecy, speaking in tongues, healing) ceased with the end of the apostolic age or the completion of the biblical canon.
- **Dispensationalism:** A theological system that divides biblical history into distinct periods or dispensations, often (though not always) associated with a cessationist view of spiritual gifts.
- Epistemology: The branch of philosophy concerned with the nature and scope of knowledge, including its sources, justification, and limits. This is a central point of contention in the cessationist/non-cessationist debate.
- **Eschaton:** The final period of history or the end times, often associated with the second coming of Christ and the establishment of God's eternal kingdom.
- **Glossolalia:** Speaking in an unintelligible language, often associated with the experience of the baptism of the Holy Spirit in Pentecostal and Charismatic movements.
- Hermeneutic of Continuity: An approach to interpreting scripture that emphasizes a direct and unbroken continuity between biblical practices and present-day church life, often used to support non-cessationist views.

- Non-cessationism: The theological belief that all the spiritual gifts described in the New Testament, including miraculous ones, continue to be available and operative in the church today.
- **Pentecostalism:** A modern Protestant movement that began in the early 1900s, characterized by the belief in the baptism of the Holy Spirit as a distinct experience after conversion, often evidenced by speaking in tongues, and the active manifestation of spiritual gifts.
- Third Wave: A movement that emerged in the 1980s, emphasizing the presentday availability of supernatural gifts for ministry ("power evangelism" and "power healing") but distinguishing itself from Pentecostalism and the Charismatic Renewal by avoiding those labels.

5. FAQs on Meadors, 1 Corinthians, Session 31, Response to Spiritual Gifts Questions, 1 Cor. 13-14, Excursus on Gifts

Frequently Asked Questions on Spiritual Gifts and the Renewal Movement

1. What is the historical context of the discussion on spiritual gifts, particularly miraculous ones, as mentioned in the lecture?

The discussion on spiritual gifts, especially miraculous ones, has been a significant topic within the Christian faith, particularly highlighted by the Charismatic and Renewal Movements. This lecture provides a brief historical overview of these movements, which have actively engaged with the questions surrounding the operation and relevance of spiritual gifts, as discussed by Paul in 1 Corinthians chapters 12-14.

2. Can you explain the "three waves" of the Renewal Movement and their key characteristics?

The "three waves" categorize the historical development of the modern Renewal Movement, as outlined by C. Peter Wagner.

- The First Wave: Pentecostalism This movement began in the early 1900s, rooted in early American Revivalism and significantly emerging within black and non-white communities. The landmark event is the Azusa Street Revival (1906-1913). A distinctive teaching was the necessity of a post-conversion experience called baptism in the Holy Spirit, often evidenced by speaking in tongues. Pentecostalism led to the formation of new denominations.
- The Second Wave: The Charismatic Renewal This wave involved individuals within mainline denominations adopting Pentecostal doctrines, including the baptism of the Holy Spirit and the exercise of supernatural gifts, without leaving their original denominations. They formed subgroups and para-church organizations but generally did not join Pentecostal churches.
- The Third Wave: The Wimber Movement This wave, associated with John Wimber and popularized by C. Peter Wagner, embraced supernatural gifts as normative for the church today but intentionally avoided the labels "Pentecostal" or "Charismatic." The Vineyard Church is a key representative of this movement, which emphasized "power evangelism" and "power healing" and influenced many levels of evangelical Christianity.

3. What is the significance of the "baptism of the Holy Spirit" in the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements?

In the Pentecostal movement, a post-conversion religious experience termed "baptism of the Holy Spirit" was considered a crucial event for believers. It was often seen as necessary for effective ministry, with speaking in tongues frequently regarded as the initial physical evidence of this baptism. The Charismatic movement also adopted this doctrine, viewing it as a second work of grace that enabled the exercise of supernatural gifts within existing denominations.

4. What are the cessationist and non-cessationist views regarding spiritual gifts?

The cessationist view holds that certain miraculous spiritual gifts, such as prophecy in the sense of new revelation, speaking in tongues (as a sign gift), and the working of sign miracles "on demand," ceased with the end of the apostolic age, primarily after the first century and the completion of the New Testament. This view often rests on theological arguments concerning the unique foundational role of the apostles and prophets in establishing the church and authenticating God's Word.

The non-cessationist view argues that all the miraculous gifts of the Holy Spirit that were evident in the first-century church continue to be available and operative throughout church history, including the present day. This perspective often emphasizes the continuity between the biblical accounts of spiritual gifts and contemporary experiences, viewing these gifts as equipping the church for ministry until the return of Christ.

5. What are some of the key arguments used by cessationists to support their position?

Cessationists often argue:

- The foundational role of apostles and prophets: They believe these roles, along with the sign gifts that authenticated their message, were unique to the establishment of the church (Ephesians 2:20).
- The completion and sufficiency of Scripture: With the Bible complete, they argue that ongoing revelatory gifts are no longer needed.
- The nature of the apostolic office: They view the apostles as having unique qualifications (e.g., seeing the resurrected Christ) and performing unique signs that are not normative for believers today.

• The lack of predictable manifestation: They point to the absence of the same emphasis and nature of miraculous gifts in later New Testament writings (like the Pastoral Epistles) as evidence of a shift.

6. What are some of the key arguments used by non-cessationists to support their position?

Non-cessationists often argue:

- The face value of New Testament texts: They interpret the descriptions of spiritual gifts in the early church as normative for all times unless explicitly stated otherwise.
- The equipping of the church for ministry: They believe miraculous gifts are essential for effective ministry and spiritual warfare throughout the church age.
- The continuity of spiritual gifts: They see a consistent pattern of God's empowering through the Spirit, including miraculous manifestations, from the Old Testament through the New Testament and into the present.
- Redefinition of certain terms: Some redefine terms like "apostle" or "prophecy" to allow for their continuation in the present day.

7. How does the lecture discuss the epistemological challenges in evaluating claims of miraculous gifts?

The lecture highlights the significant epistemological challenges in validating or invalidating claims of miraculous gifts. It points out that while individuals may have subjective experiences, these "claims" are not ultimate authority. Theology, based on the interpretation of Scripture, is presented as the primary framework for evaluating such claims. The broadening definition of "miraculous" to include emotional victories and psychological healing further complicates objective assessment. Ultimately, the lecture suggests that while God is certainly able to perform miracles, the debate often centers on whether individuals possess the gift to perform them "on demand" and how these contemporary claims align with biblical teaching.

8. What resources does the lecturer recommend for further study on the topic of spiritual gifts and the Renewal Movement?

The lecturer recommends engaging with a variety of sources representing different perspectives. Key authors and their works mentioned include:

Richard Gaffin: Perspectives on Pentecost (a key cessationist work)

- Wayne Grudem: Our Miraculous Gifts for Today (a prominent non-cessationist work)
- **John Ruthven:** On the Cessation of the Charismata (a significant non-cessationist work, revised edition recommended)
- Robert Redmond
- Max Turner
- Fowler White

The lecturer emphasizes the importance of reading primary sources from both cessationist and non-cessationist viewpoints, including books, journal articles, and even materials from movements like the Vineyard Church. He encourages thorough research and critical engagement with these materials to form one's own informed conclusions.